श्री सिकन्दर बख्त (व्यवधान) मुझे कोई इजाजत नहीं दी, सदर साहिबा। . . . (**व्यवधान**)

شری سکندر بخت: . . . "مداخلت" . . . مجھے کوئی اجازت نہیں دی۔ صدر صاحبہ . . . "مداخلت" . . .

उपसभापति: कल भी आप बोले, कल भी आप बोलकर चले गए वाकआउट करके, मैंने कुछ नहीं कहा। आज भी मैंने आपसे . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: क्या वाकआउट करना हमारे अख्त्यार में नहीं है? . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . आपने जो कहा कि आपने कुछ नहीं कहा, तो क्या आपको हमारे वाकआउट पर भी एतराज है?

شری سکندر بخت: کیا واک آؤٹ کرنا ہمارے اختیار میں نہیں ہے . . . "مداخلت" . . . آپ نے جو کہا کہ آپ نے کچھ نہیں کہا تو کیا آپ کو ہمارے واک آؤٹ پر بھی اعتراض ہے۔

उपसभापति: नहीं, मुझे कोई ऐतराज नहीं है।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: फिर क्या कर रही हैं आप। . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . आप मुझे माफ करेंगी। . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . .

شری سکندر بخت: پھر کیا کہہ رہی ہیں آپ . . . "مداخلت" . . . آپ مجھے معاف کریں گی . . . "مداخلت" . . .

REPORT AND MINUTES OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS

SHRI SARADA MOHANTY (Orissa): Madam, I beg to lay on the Table a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Third Report of the Standing Committee on Railways on "Gauge Conversion on Indian Railways" and Minutes of the Sittings of the Committee relating thereto.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Inder Kumar Gujral . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Yes, Mr. Gujral . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सख्त प्रोटेस्ट के तौर पर हम रिकार्ड पर लाना चाहते हैं कि लोक सभा में बयान दिया गया, यहां नहीं दिया गया और जो लोक सभा में बयान दिया गया वह भी अपने वायदों के खिलाफ दिया गया। इसलिए हम हाउस से वाकआउट करते हैं।

شری سکندر بخت: سخت پروٹسٹ کے طور پر ہم ریکارڈ پر لانا چاہتے ہیں کہ لوک سبھا میں بیان دیا گیا۔ یہاں نہیں دیا گیا۔ اور جو لوک سبھا میں بیان دیا گیا وہ بھی اپنے وعدوں کے خلاف دیا گیا۔ اس لیے ہم ہاؤس سے واک آؤٹ کرتے ہیں۔

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

उपसभापति: क्या बयान दिया था?

वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री और संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्यमंत्री (डा० अब्दुल अहमद): मैडम, माननीय विपक्ष के नेता ने जो लोक सभा में बयान की बात कही, मैंने पहले भी सदन के अंदर कहा है और आज फिर मैं इस बात को दोहरा रहा हूं कि सरकार बिल्कुल यह नहीं चाहती कि उनके नेता बंद रहें। लेकिन वे कानूनी प्रक्रिया को पूरी करें और कानूनी प्रक्रिया को पूरी करके वे बाहर आ सकते हैं।

† Transliteration in Arabic Script.

वे अपने आपको कानून के ऊपर न समझें। मैंने पहले भी इस सदन के अंदर कहा है कि सिकन्दर बख्त साहब जिस समय कैबिनेट मिनिस्टर थे जिस सरकार में, उस समय इंदिरा जी को गिरफ्तार किया गया था। वे मजिस्ट्रेट के सामने गईं, उन्होंने जमानत दी और उसके बाद बाहर आईं। उन्होंने कानून को कभी अपने से ऊपर नहीं समझा। ये भी अपने को कानून से ऊपर नहीं समझें। अगर मुकदमे झूठे हैं या सच्चे हैं, तो वह कानून बताएगा, कोर्ट बताएगा, जुडिशियरी बताएगी। क्यों नहीं आपको जुडिशियरी में विश्वास है? क्यों नहीं आपको कानून में विश्वास है? सच और झूठ का फैसला कानून करेगा, मजिस्ट्रेट करेगा, उसके सामने जाने से क्यों कतराते हैं? आप लोग कानूनी प्रक्रिया को पूरी करें और इस तरह से देश को धोखा न दें कि उनको सरकार ने बंद किया हुआ है। कानूनी प्रक्रिया आप पूरी नहीं करना चाहते हैं। सरकार चाहती है कि आप कानूनी प्रक्रिया पूरी करें और बाहर आएं। अपने आपको कानून के ऊपर न समझें। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री त्रिलोकी नाथ चतुर्वेदी (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभापति महोदया, कानूनी मामले का जिक्र किया गया है, तो कानूनी मामले की सफाई हम लोगों को भी करने की इजाजत देनी चाहिए। अगर मिनिस्टर साहब, डा० अबरार अहमद, यह समझते हैं तथा कानूनी मामला वही समझते हैं तो कानूनी मामले के लिए हमें सफाई देनी चाहिए और इससे पहले वह स्टेटमेंट जो वहां दिया गया है, वहां पर पेश किया जाए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Inder Kumar Gujral ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam, I want to make a submission ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jagesh Desai, please wait. Let him lay the Report ... (*Interruptions*) ... Let him lay the Report. Will you please sit down, Mr. Desai? ... (*Interruptions*) ... Let him lay the Report. He is laying a Report now ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, when the Leader of the Opposition was speaking, the Members of his own party were in the Well. They had no respect for their own leader ... (*Interruptions*) ... Madam, this has never happened in parliament. When the Leader of the Opposition was speaking, his own party Members were in the Well. This should be taken note of ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a problem of their own party, if somebody does not respect anybody ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): There is an associated problem here, Madam. They were reciting "Hari Om" here. Madam, they were wearing suits and boots like English butlers and they were reciting "Hari Om" ... (*Interruptions*) ... They should dress like Indians and come here and then sing "Hari Om". Otherwise, they should sing some foreign songs instead of "Hari Om" ... (*Interruptions*) ...

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार): महोदया, मैं आपसे यह अनुरोध करना चाहता हूं कि जो वहां पर हुआ, उसका दूरदर्शन पर प्रसारण नहीं होना चाहिए।

उपसभापति: हां, होना चाहिए।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह: इसका लोगों पर बहुत बुरा असर पड़ता है। खास तौर से जो लोग दूरदर्शन न देखते हैं वे सोचते हैं तथा इसी तरह संसद की गरिमा समाप्त होती है। मैडम, मैं आपसे यह अर्ज करना चाहता हूं कि इस तरह की जो भी हरकतें होती हैं, एक तरफ तो लोकतंत्र कलंकित होता है, सदन की मर्यादा इससे समाप्त होती है। मैं चाहता हूं कि इसे जो लोग देखते हैं उनके ऊपर भी इसका बहुत बुरा असर पड़ता है।

उपसभापति : लेकिन करते क्यों हैं ऐसी बातें ? करेंगे तो देखेंगे भी ।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : इसका प्रसारण नहीं होना चाहिए, यह मैं आपसे प्रार्थना करता हूं

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया (बिहार) मैडम, यह जरुर दिखाया जाए ताकि जनता को पता लगे।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will look into it ... (*Interruptions*) ... I will look into it ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, you can certainly ask the Leader of the Opposition to wear Indian clothes and not come here dressed in tie and coat ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is not my job.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : No, no. They are Bhartiya Janata Party. They should at least set an example.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You may give a suggestion. That is not my job. Yes, Mr. Ashok Mitra.

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया : टी. वी. पर जरूर दिखाना चाहिए । ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : आज यहां पर वह ऐनाउंस कर रहे थे कि रोज इसी तरह का नाटक होगा । रोज इसी तरह का नाटक होता है । इसलिए मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि मीडिया से इसका प्रचार बंद होना चाहिए, रोज मीडिया को यह नहीं दिखाना चाहिए ... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : आपका और जो अहलुवालिया जी का सुझाव है उस पर गौर करेंगे ... (**व्यवधान**)

Now, let us work in peace.

अभी तो कल दिखाने की बात है ... (**व्यवधान**)

The whole day is there. I will think about it. Let me hear what Mr. Ashok Mitra wants to say.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. I will call you.
(*Interuptions*)

SHRI ASHOK MITRA (West Bengal) : Madam, we shall be very unhappy if on receiving the record of proceedings of today, we saw it recorded, that the Question Hour was held as usual. The Question Hour was not held as usual. We could not participate in the Question Hour. We had many important, substantive question to raise. But we could not compete in lung power. And we do not have extra-sensory perception. So, I would humbly request you, Madam, to ensure that the questions which we were not allowed to raise, we are given another opportunity to raise them. This is very important. You yourself have admitted, Madam, that the Question Hour was not allowed to be held.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, I agree with you. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. Let me reply to him. Mr. Ashok Mitra, you were a witness to it. I called your name. You could not hear. You did not raise it. And twice I called.

AN HON. MEMBER : How could he hear ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I tried my level best to persuade the Members to allow Question Hour because Members give notice, they prepare the questions and the Ministers come prepared. It costs a lot of money of the Government, of the people's effort. And I have given permission to them that at 12 o'clock, after the Question Hour is over, I will permit them to say whatever they wanted to say. But they did not listen. But till we cannot work under pressure. We have to continue. As regard, the question whether we should permit it inter on, we will see how we can work it. What the technicalities are of it; we will look into it definitely.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA : Just another sentence. We have also to provide explanation to our constituents. And what shall we

tell our constituents, that questions were asked, questions which directly refer to important Centre-State relations, but on record it will be shown that we did not ask our question? We are not being fair to our constituents. And I am afraid this House is not being fair to some of us. And we are at your mercy.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Not my mercy, today at least. You were at the mercy of some people who were in the well.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मैं एक मिनट में अपनी बात कह देना चाहता हूं . . . (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. I have identified her first

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY Andhra Pradesh : Madam, at the very outset, I beg patience and tolerance of my esteemed colleagues. I wish to just place on record, I want to say that I dissent today from this Question Hour business because, as my esteemed colleague, Mr. Ashok Mitra said, yes, there is a deep sense of resentment amongst a section of us that we were not allowed to ask what we wanted to. We have a question of accountability to the public. Approximately 20 Questions were tabled today which means Rs. 20 lakhs of public money. And all of us as individuals, irrespective of whether we belong to the Treasury Benches or the Opposition, are accountable for this. We have wasted the national wealth of Rs. 20 lakhs bepause we submitted to duress from a certain section of the House. Madam, I know what the motive of the BJP is. I could not care less. If they want to make a monkey of themselves, they are most welcome to do it with my best compliments. But this House is empowered in its wisdom to take action against erring Members . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . This House is empowered to deal with errant Members and their behaviour which is in violation of the set procedure and the parliamentary norms. Why did we not take action against them? We are quibbling on the question of whether I should deem it necessary to move a Resolution for suspension of Question Hour or the Treasury Benches. This tantamounts to saying that the Treasury Benches are willing to accept this misbehaviour and counter-misbehaviour from this side at our cost.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka) : When you did it in this House, we accepted. That is democracy . . . (*Interruptions*) .

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Let us not comment on personalities . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I have never . . . (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : No, we accepted it.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : In 1989, you behaved more than BJP. Don't give sermons now.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Let us not talk about individuals or their personalities I know now that they don't have the patience to hear and the courtesy to be extended to a woman Member because I asked them to be patient at the very outset.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have got some listed business. You say what your suggestion is.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : May I be permitted to continue, Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have permitted you to speak. You say what your suggestion is.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Madam, I wish to suggest to you, please call for a meeting in your Chamber of Members whom you deem fit. Let us collectively apply our mind because we are a collective House in the eyes of the nation. I think we are accountable. We have to update our behaviour and work in a manner which is conducive to the dignity of this House. I am not blaming any single person. I am not talking retrospectively about matters of 1989 or 1990. Matters do come about. Yes, this is friam for as to express our feelings. Sitting in the well is

symbolic of a certain degree of resentment which is expressed. It is part of our parliamentary procedures. But how the Chair conducts, how the Members co-operate is also part of procedure. Let us not justify saying that you did it in 1989 and so I will do it in 1993. This is absurd.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Then : what are you suggesting ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : This is juvenile attitude. We have to gain from our experience because we cannot afford to repeat it : the wastage of Rs. 20 lakhs of public money particularly when the nation is in economic depression ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : You are a party to it.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I have stated my opinion in this House and I am entitled to give my own opinion because I have suffered from both the sides. It is my party opinion—my respected colleagues have co-operated with me ... (*Interruptions*) ... please desist from making personal comments.

Madam, what I am saying is that if we are serious about shaping the destiny of the nation, then let us do it. Don't talk about my behaviour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What are you suggesting ? Please don't give a lecture.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : The House is empowered to take action ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What action ? You should have moved the motion.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Madam, we have to know what her suggestion is. Her suggestion is to throw the Members out of the House and continue parliament. In Emergency, such things ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I have never said that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What do you suggest ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I am misunderstood ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your suggestion ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : What I said is on record. I said that this House was empowered ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : We have not forgotten ... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, one minute ... (*Interruptions*) ... Have patience, Mr. Narayanasamy. Let me ask her what her suggestion is.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : We have not forgotten the amount of obstruction that she has created ... (*Interruptions*) ...

सभापतिः आप अपना सुझाव एक लाइन में कह दीजिए। (व्यवधान)

What is your suggestion, Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Madam, my suggestion is—I have placed it on record—that you please call for a meeting of Members whom you deem fit to talk to. Let something concrete come out of this issue so that we don't repeat this farce of Question Hour next time. If there is something wrong in that, if Members like Shri Kamal Morarka, in their judgement think that I have asked you to throw out the BJP Members, if it is their opinion, I am not accountable for that.

श्री एस०एस० अहलूवालियाः आज सदन में जो कुछ हुआ यह कोई नई बात नहीं है । ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order in the House, at least now.

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया : इस सदन में आए दिन ऐसी घटनाएं घटती हैं। इन घटनाओं को मद्दे नजर रखते हुए प्रेजाईडिंग आफिसर्स कान्फ्रेंस जो पिछले साल हुई थी उसमें कुछ फैसले लिये गये थे। उन फैसलों में सबसे बड़ा फैसला क्वेश्चन अवर, प्रश्न काल के बारे में लिया गया था। 20 दिन पहले क्वेश्चन का नोटिस दिया जाता है . . . (**व्यवधान**)। सुकोमल सेन जी, कौन नहीं मानता है ? आपके जो वेस्ट बंगाल एसेम्बली के स्पीकर हैं वे उसमें पार्टी हैं। हिन्दुस्तान में जितनी भी राज्य विधान सभाएं हैं उन सब के स्पीकर और डिप्टी स्पीकर यहां आये थे और उस सम्मेलन में उन्होंने हिस्सा लिया था और सर्व सम्मति से निर्णय लिया था। वह निर्णय यह था कि प्रश्नकाल कभी भी एंडजर्न नहीं होगा। अगर यह गलत है तो महोदया, आप सुधारने की कोशिश करें . . . (**व्यवधान**)।

श्री राम प्रकाश भालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : यह तो रूल्स में दिया गया है।

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया : हर एक पोलिटिकल पार्टी के लोगों ने इसका समर्थन किया। इस लिए आज यह फैसला लेने की जरूरत है कि अगर किसी को कोई आपत्ति है या कोई महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दा उठाना चाहता है तो जीरो आवर में उठा ले और उसके बाद चेयर के परमिशन से उठा सकता है। प्रश्नों के लिए 20 दिन पहले नोटिस दिया जाता है और वायरलैस से खबर जाती है। वायरलैस से उसका जवाब आता है . . . (**व्यवधान**)।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now let us close ths matter and do some business. (*Interruptions*).

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया : इस पर कई लाख रूपये खर्च होते हैं। सारा हिन्दुस्तान उसका इंतजार करता है। उसके बावजूद प्रश्नों का यह हश्र होता है। यह बड़ा दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है। मेरी यही गुजारिश है कि आप फिर सब पोलिटिकल लीडरों की मीटिंग बुलायें और एक निर्णय लें कि प्रश्नकाल में कोई आपत्ति नहीं की जाएगी।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no, I am not opening a discussion on this. (*Interruptions*). That matter is closed with my comment that already many meetings have taken place. Many meetings have been there. Many chairmen have called meetings. I have had discussions. The presiding Officers' Conference has taken a decision not once but many times, and it is a part of our rules also. But unfortunately, the rules are violated. The Chair's hands are tied. If a motion is moved to suspend the Question Hour and it is carried by a majority of votes, I can suspend it. In the absence of a motion moved in the House, I would not arbitrarily, like a dictator, suspend the Question Hour. I cannot work under pressure just because some people come into the well from any section of the House from any political party. This has been the practice in the past, this is the pratice now in the present and it will be the practice in the future also. This is my opinion. That is the opinion of others. So it is for the leaders of various political parties and the Members to think about it.

Some of the Members put the questions and I am sorry that some of them could not ask. (*Interruptions*). Now, Mr. Inder Kumar Gujral to lay the Report.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : महोदय, हम लोगों को जो क्वेश्चन पेपर्स दिये जाते हैं, ये तो सबसे बड़ी चीज राज्य सभा की है। आज मंगलवार है। टूडे इज ट्यूजडे। हमारे पास जो क्वेश्चन पेपर्स दिये गये हैं उसमें सोमवार लिखा है। टूडे इज नोट सोमवार। आज मंगलवार है। राज्य सभा की ओर से अगर ऐसी गलती हो तो मैं समझता हूं कि यह बहुत बड़ी गलती है। इसलिए मैं

चाहता हूं कि सेक्रेटरिएट को इसके लिए सावधानी बर्तनी चाहिए ... (व्यवधान) ।

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया : आप कहां से बोल रहे हैं ?

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : आपने लाल पगड़ी बांध ली तो आपको लाल ही दिखाई देता है

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no. What he is saying about the Unstarred Questions. (*Interruptions*). Wait a minute. Let the papers be laid on the Table of the House.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : It is Tuesday here—14th December.

उपसभापति : वे हिन्दी वाले में कह रहे और आप अंग्रेज़ी वाले में कह रहे हैं ।

I want to bring it to the notices of the Secretariat to see and make a correction.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA (Gujrat) : They go on disturbing the Question Hour. My name was also there. It is the function of the presiding officer to bring the House to order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right, that matter is over (*Interruptions*). I am not permitting you.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : If they go on disturbing the Question Hour ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not permitting.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : I am not afraid of emergency. People have to be thrown out if they disturb the House. What is wrong in it ? They are depriving us of the opportunity of asking questions. Do not refer to emergency. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I agree with you.

आप सब बैठिये ।

Please, order in the House. Mr. Kamal Morarka, will you please keep quiet ? If you felt so, Mr. Mehta, why did you not move the motion ?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : You cannot hear nobody can here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I can hear. You could have come to me and moved the motion.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : Tomorrow you allow me. I will ask them to be thrown out of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now please sit down.

आप बठ जाइये । बात खत्म हो गयी । आप बैठ जाइये ।

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : If anybody does it in the Question Hour, then he will have to go out. Question Hour is Members' Question Hour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, don't disrupt the House. Yes, Mr. Gujral.

THIRD REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, I beg to present the Third Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related parliamentary Standing Committee on Commerce—Draft Dunkel Proposals.

EVIDENCE TENDERED BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE ON DRAFT DUNKEL PROPOSALS

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the evidence tendered before the Department-related parliamentary Standing Committee on Commerce—Draft Dunkel Proposals.